World Justice Project

Mexico States
Rule of Law
Index 2020-2021

Insights

Results and trends
World Justice Project

Mexico States
Rule of Law
Index 2020-2021

Insights

Results and trends
Table of Contents

7 Introduction
10 Summary Table: Scores and Rankings
12 Changes in the Scores of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index Over Time, at the State Level
14 Advances and Setbacks of the Rule of Law in Mexico, at the State Level
15 Advances and Setbacks in the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021, by Factor
16 Scores of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021, by Sub-factor
16 Factor 1. Constraints on Government Powers
17 Factor 2. Absence of Corruption
17 Factor 3. Open Government
18 Factor 4. Fundamental Rights
19 Factor 5. Order & Security
20 Factor 6. Regulatory Enforcement
21 Factor 7. Civil Justice
22 Factor 8. Criminal Justice
23 Decreases of Factor 8. Criminal Justice
24 Word Clouds
26 Decline in Factor 8. Criminal Justice and Interruption of Justice Services During the COVID-19 Pandemic
27 Reduction of the Civic Space and the Decline of the Press as an Effective Check on State Governments
28 Decline of Control of Corruption in Security and Law Enforcement Forces
29 Challenges in Environmental Regulatory Enforcement
30 Rule of Law and Public Health During Pandemics
31 Factors and Sub-factors of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021
32 Methodology
33 About the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021
33 About the World Justice Project
34 Other publications from the World Justice Project
The Mexico States Rule of Law Index recognizes that there are multiple dimensions of the rule of law, so it is organized into eight factors:

- Constraints on Government Powers
- Absence of Corruption
- Open Government
- Fundamental Rights
- Order and Security
- Regulatory Enforcement
- Civil Justice
- Criminal Justice
Introduction

The *Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021* is the third edition of the most comprehensive measurement of the rule of law in Mexico’s 32 states.

Over more than a decade, the World Justice Project® (WJP) has developed the most comprehensive tool for measuring the rule of law around the world. Based on surveys conducted in over 120 countries, the *WJP Rule of Law Index®* captures the experiences and perspectives of the general population and experts on different aspects of the rule of law and presents a complete overview of institutional trends, strengths, and weaknesses on this subject around the world.

The *Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021* is the third edition of the only subnational index produced by the WJP and measures the adherence to the rule of law in each of the country’s 32 states. The *Mexico States Rule of Law Index* uses the same conceptual framework and methodology that the WJP has used around the globe, but it has been adapted to take into account the institutional architecture and competencies of different levels of government. The *Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021* captures the perspectives and experiences of more than 25,000 people throughout the country, as well as more than 2,300 experts in civil justice, criminal justice, labor justice, and public health, who were surveyed between July and October 2020, in addition to the results of a multiplicity of surveys and databases from other recognized institutions (third-party sources). This information reveals the circumstances of different demographic sectors, including people in vulnerable groups, and enables an analysis of each of the 32 states.

The *Mexico States Rule of Law Index* acknowledges that the rule of law is multidimensional, so it is organized by eight factors: 1) Constraints on Government Powers, 2) Absence of Corruption, 3) Open Government, 4) Fundamental Rights, 5) Order and Security, 6) Regulatory Enforcement, 7) Civil Justice, and 8) Criminal Justice. These factors disaggregate into 42 sub-factors.

The Index is aimed at a wide audience that includes decision-makers at the state and federal level, legislators, civil society organizations, academia, and the media, among others. Its potential as a decision-making tool is highlighted by the citations of the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index* in multiple state and national government planning documents to inform their respective diagnoses and strategies, as well as to measure advances in the rule of law. Our intention is that this tool is used to identify strengths and weaknesses, as well as changes and trends in each state, and to promote public policies that strengthen the rule of law in Mexico.
Main Findings 2020-2021
Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021: Insights
provides a photograph of the states in a year in which the
strengths of some states were tested, and the weaknesses
of others were highlighted.

The results of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-
2021 show a stagnation in the country’s progress towards
strengthening the rule of law, with marginal changes in
the general scores of most states since the 2019-2020
edition of the Index. Notwithstanding the above, the data
show some changes in some aspects of the rule of law.
The COVID-19 pandemic and the subsequent response
measures disrupted the functioning of government
institutions. In most states, judicial institutions were
particularly affected by this situation, as shown by
decreases in the scores of Factor 8. The data also show
a weakening of freedom of the press and a shrinking
civic space in most states (with decreases in sub-factor
1.5 scores), continuing a trend that began before the
pandemic and deepened during the public health crisis. As
in previous editions, public safety continues to be one of
the greatest challenges in Mexico, although many states
recorded a decrease in crime incidence and prevalence
rates (with increases in sub-factor 5.2 scores).

The Index presents data organized into eight factors of
the rule of law: 1) Constraints on Government Powers,
2) Absence of Corruption, 3) Open Government, 4)
Fundamental Rights, 5) Order and Security, 6) Regulatory
Enforcement, 7) Civil Justice, and 8) Criminal Justice. The
scores of the eight factors are disaggregated into 42 sub-
factors, which reflect the perspectives and experiences of
more than 25,000 citizens from all over the country and
more than 2,300 specialists in civil justice, criminal justice,
labor justice, and public health (who were polled between
July and October of 2020), as well as the results of a
variety of surveys and databases on topics related to the
rule of law (third-party sources).

The gap between the states’ scores and the ideal score
(the Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the
highest adherence to the rule of law) is still substantial,
which implies that all states face challenges to strengthen
the rule of law. The states with the highest scores in the
Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021 are Yucatán
(0.47), Coahuila (0.45), and Campeche (0.44). Yucatán has
been at the top of the ranking in the three editions of the
Index, while Coahuila and Campeche improved from the
6th and 4th place from the previous edition, respectively.
The states with the lowest scores are Quintana Roo (0.34),
Puebla (0.35), and Morelos (0.36).

Since the last edition of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index
(2019-2020), scores increased modestly in seventeen
states (Baja California Sur, Campeche, Chihuahua,
Coahuila, Guanajuato, Guerrero, Michoacán, Nayarit,
Querétaro, San Luis Potosi, Sinaloa, Sonora, Tabasco,
Tamaulipas, Tlaxcala, Yucatán, and Zacatecas), decreased
in five (Aguascalientes, Baja California, Oaxaca, Quintana
Roo, and Veracruz), and remained unchanged in ten
(Chiapas, Colima, Durango, Hidalgo, Jalisco, Mexico City,
Morelos, Nuevo León, Puebla, and State of Mexico).

On the other hand, four states stand out for showing
significant progress in general scores of the Mexico States
Rule of Law Index in the three editions since 2018: Baja
California Sur (from 0.35 in 2018 to 0.43 in 2020-2021),
Guerrero (from 0.29 to 0.36), Sonora (from 0.36 to 0.40),
and Nayarit (from 0.37 to 0.42).

1 Scores are rounded to two decimal places.
Advances and Setbacks of the Rule of Law in Mexico

The main challenge of the rule of law during the public health crisis was undoubtedly the criminal justice system. The score for Factor 8: Criminal Justice decreased in 16 states since the previous edition of the Index (Aguascalientes, Baja California Sur, Chiapas, Colima, Durango, Guanajuato, Michoacán, Morelos, Nayarit, Oaxaca, Quintana Roo, San Luis Potosí, Sinaloa, State of Mexico, Veracruz, and Zacatecas). The sub-factor with the highest decreases in scores were sub-factor 8.2, which measures the efficiency and effectiveness of the systems of prosecution and administration of justice, and sub-factor 8.4, which measures whether due process of law for the accused is effectively guaranteed (including the presumption of innocence, the principle of equality in the criminal process, absence of discrimination, the treatment received by detained people, the right to an adequate defense, and the right to a public trial before a competent and impartial judge). With unique data collected during the pandemic, this finding reflects the experiences and perspectives of criminal justice specialists across the country.

The data suggest that criminal justice systems were affected by the lack of timely and appropriate Open and Digital Justice measures to enable access to citizens by remote and collaborative means. In fact, most of the country’s jurisdictional bodies were forced to suspend their operations for a significant period of time, despite that all federal and local judicial activity was categorized as essential by health authorities. Also, the country still faces challenges in criminal investigation. In the three editions of the Index, most states have their lowest scores in sub-factor 8.1, which measures whether the police and the Prosecutor’s Office (Ministerio Público) investigate crimes efficiently. This is largely due to the ‘dark figure’, or the number of crimes that are not reported or recorded by the police. INEGI estimates this figure at 92.4% nationally, according to the National Survey on Victimization and Perception of Public Security (ENVIPE) 2020.

Security continues to be one of the greatest challenges in Mexico, highlighted by the homicide rates (sub-factor 5.1), the perceptions of insecurity (sub-factor 5.3), and the decrease in scores in absence of corruption in the safety and law enforcement systems (sub-factor 2.3) in twenty states, according to the experiences of specialists polled during 2020. However, there were improvements in crime incidence and prevalence indicators in most states. Scores of sub-factor 5.2, which measures absence of crime, increased in 26 states due to decreases in crime incidence and prevalence rates of ENVIPE 2020, which measures crimes that occurred in 2019.

Finally, the Index data show a continuous weakening of the freedom of the press and a shrinking civic space, reflected in the decreases of sub-factor 1.5 scores in sixteen states. Despite this decline, civil society and the press are the most effective check and balances on state governments for the third time, well above the legislative branch, the judiciary, oversight and control agencies, and human rights commissions.
Summary Table: Scores and Rankings

Like in the previous edition, states generally show substantial gaps in reaching the ideal score in the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021*. Scores range from 0 to 1, with 1 indicating the strongest adherence to the rule of law. With a score of 0.47, Yucatán is ranked first for the third consecutive time. On the other hand, Quintana Roo is at the bottom of the ranking, with a score of 0.34. Baja California Sur (+0.04) and Guerrero (+0.03), show significant score increases compared to the previous edition of the Index.

*Scores are rounded to two decimal places.*

> In times of COVID-19, great challenges are being faced by the State to guarantee the full exercise of freedoms and rights. — Prof. Maribel Flores Sánchez, ITESM, specialist in criminal law, Puebla
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>Score*</th>
<th>Change 2019–2020–2020–2021*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Yucatán</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Coahuila</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Campeche</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Querétaro</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Zacatecas</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Aguascalientes</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Nuevo León</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Guanajuato</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Baja California Sur</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Sinaloa</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Durango</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Hidalgo</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Nayarit</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Colima</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Chihuahua</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Tamaulipas</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Sonora</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Michoacán</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Oaxaca</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Baja California</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>San Luis Potosí</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Chiapas</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Tabasco</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Tlaxcala</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Jalisco</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Veracruz</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>State of Mexico</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Mexico City</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Guerrero</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Morelos</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Puebla</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Quintana Roo</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Average of the 32 states: 0.40

* Scores rounded to two decimal places.
Changes in the Scores of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index Over Time, at the State Level

Scores of the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index* for the 32 states in the 2018, 2019-2020, and 2020-2021 editions. The graphs include the trend of the average of the 32 states as a reference.

Mostly, state scores have remained stable throughout the three editions of the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index*. However, despite the COVID-19 pandemic, two states stand out for showing significant increases: Guerrero and Baja California Sur. Additionally, Sonora and Nayarit managed to maintain their upward trend. On the other hand, Baja California, Chiapas, and Quintana Roo decreased their scores both in 2019-2020 and in 2020-2021.

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law.
States that Remained Unchanged from 2018 to 2020-2021

Aguascalientes
State of Mexico
Hidalgo
Jalisco
Michoacán
Oaxaca
San Luis Potosi
Tabasco
Tlaxcala
Veracruz
Zacatecas

States that Decreased from 2018 to 2020-2021

Baja California
Chiapas
Mexico City
Morelos
Puebla
Quintana Roo

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law.
Advances and Setbacks of the Rule of Law in Mexico, at the State Level

Changes in the score of the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index*, from the 2019-2020 to the 2020-2021 edition, by state.

Scores of the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index* increased in 17 states, decreased in 5, and stayed the same in 10.

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law.
Advances and Setbacks in the **Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021**, by Factor

The following graph shows the number of states with statistically significant changes in each factor of the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index*, from the 2019-2020 edition to the 2020-2021 edition.

The factor with most changes is Factor 5. Order and safety, with six states showing statistically significant increases, mainly due to a decrease in crime prevalence and incidence rates (Campeche, Chiapas, Guerrero, Nayarit, Sonora, and Yucatán).

States with statistically significant decreases in their score | States with statistically significant increases in their score | Number of states without changes
---|---|---
Factor 1. Constraints on Government Powers | 1 | 2 | 29
Factor 2. Absence of Corruption | 2 | 6 | 32
Factor 3. Open Government | * | * | *
Factor 4. Fundamental Rights | 2 | 30 | 30
Factor 5. Order & Security | 1 | 2 | 26
Factor 6. Regulatory Enforcement | 1 | 1 | 29
Factor 7. Civil Justice | 1 | 1 | 30
Factor 8. Criminal Justice | 1 | 1 | 30

The results of the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021* show a stagnation in the country’s progress towards strengthening the rule of law, with marginal changes in the general scores of most states since the 2019-2020 edition of the Index.

*Factor 3 did not change from the 2018 edition of the Index. For more details, refer to the Methodology section of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021 report.*
For the third time, the most effective checks on the state governments are civil society and the media (sub-factor 1.5). On the other hand, oversight and control agencies (particularly state comptrollers’ offices) (sub-factor 1.3), are the checks with the lowest scores in the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021.
Absence of corruption in the judiciary (sub-factor 2.2) has the highest scores in most states, according to the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021. Corruption in the legislature (sub-factor 2.4) has the lowest scores in Factor 2 for the third time.

In Open Government, the indicator that measures access to information (sub-factor 3.2) is strong, while the indicator that measures citizen participation (sub-factor 3.1) has the greatest challenges.

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law. The states with the highest and lowest scores for each indicator are shown. Scores are rounded to two decimal places.
Factor 4

Fundamental Rights

4.1. Absence of discrimination

4.3. Due process of law

4.4. Freedom of opinion

4.5. Freedom of religion

4.6. Right to privacy

4.7. Freedom of association

4.8. Labor rights

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law. The states with the highest and lowest scores for each indicator are shown. Scores are rounded to two decimal places.
The Security Challenge in Mexico

Security continues to be one of Mexico’s greatest challenges, considering homicide rates, crime rates, and the perception of insecurity. Nonetheless, crime rates and perception of security show slight improvements. The below data is pulled from the Mexico States Rule of Law Index (MSI).

### Homicides per 100,000 population

1. **# of states with 12 or fewer homicides per every 100,000 inhabitants** (equivalent to a score equal or higher than 0.50 in the IEDMX)
2. **# of states with more than 12 homicides per every 100,000 inhabitants** (equivalent to a score lower than 0.50 in the IEDMX)

### Victims per 100,000 population

1. **# of states with 24 thousand crime victims or less per 100,000 inhabitants** (equivalent to a score equal or higher than 0.50 in the IEDMX)
2. **# of states with more than 24 thousand crime victims per 100,000 inhabitants** (equivalent to a score lower than 0.50 in the IEDMX)

### Perception of insecurity in the state (%)
The indicator with the lowest scores of Factor 6 in the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021 is the guarantee of due process in administrative procedures (sub-factor 6.4).

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law. The states with the highest and lowest scores for each indicator are shown. Scores are rounded to two decimal places.
Factor 7
Civil Justice

7.1 People know their rights

7.2 Access to information and affordable legal counsel in civil justice

7.3 Affordable civil justice without bureaucratic processes

7.4 Impartial and independent civil justice free of corruption

7.5 Quality civil justice

7.6 No unreasonable delay in civil justice

7.7 Effective enforcement of civil decisions

7.8 Accessible, impartial and prompt ADRs

Alternative dispute resolution mechanisms (sub-factor 7.8) are the main strength in Civil Justice. On the other hand, the indicators with the lowest scores are sub-factor 7.3, which measures whether people can resolve their conflicts without high costs, and sub-factor 7.6, which measures whether the civil justice system is expeditious.

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law. The states with the highest and lowest scores for each indicator are shown. Scores are rounded to two decimal places.
For the third time, the main challenge in the criminal justice system in Mexico is the effectiveness of criminal investigations, which is measured by sub-factor 8.1 of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021.
Decreases of Factor 8. Criminal Justice


Since the previous edition of the Index, Factor 8 decreased in 16 states, increased in 6, and remained the same in 10. The sub-factors with the highest decreases are sub-factor 8.2, which measures the efficiency of the criminal justice system, and sub-factor 8.4, which measures the respect for due process (including presumption of innocence, dignified treatment, adequate defense and access to a public trial in front of a competent and impartial judge. Sub-factor 8.2 decreased in 18 states, and sub-factor 8.4 decreased in 20 states. In both, the average difference in score since the last edition of the Index is -0.02. With unique data collected during the pandemic, this finding reflects the experiences and perspectives of criminal justice specialists across the country.

Change by sub-factor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Change by sub-factor</th>
<th>2019-2020</th>
<th>2020-2021</th>
<th>No change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zacatecas</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sinaloa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guanajuato</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aguascalientes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nayarit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oaxaca</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colima</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durango</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michoacán</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Luis Potosí</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baja California Sur</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quintana Roo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morelos</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State of Mexico</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chiapas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veracruz</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hidalgo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chihuahua</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuevo León</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tabasco</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sonora</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tamaulipas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tlaxcala</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jalisco</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico City</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puebla</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Querétaro</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coahuila</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yucatán</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baja California</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campeche</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guerrero</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What do you associate with the phrase “Rule of Law”?  

In the general population survey, administered to 25,600 people throughout the country, respondents were asked about the three words they associate with the phrase “Rule of Law.” The most common answers are presented below, by age range.

Word Clouds

18 TO 35 YEARS OLD  

48% DON’T KNOW

***Simulated text to show proportion of mentions through text size.
36 TO 59 YEARS OLD

52% DON'T KNOW

60 OR MORE YEARS OLD

59% DON'T KNOW
Decline in Factor 8. Criminal Justice and Interruption of Justice Services During the COVID-19 Pandemic

Changes in Factor 8. Criminal Justice scores, from the 2019-2020 to the 2020-2021 edition, by state, and the justice services that each state had available during the pandemic.

Of the 16 states that decreased their Factor 8 score from the previous edition of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index, 12 had 3 or fewer online services during the pandemic. The data suggest that criminal justice systems were affected by the lack of timely and appropriate Open and Digital Justice measures, to enable access to citizens by remote and collaborative means, which were necessary during confinement and the health emergency.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Justice Services</th>
<th>2019-2020</th>
<th>2020-2021</th>
<th>Change in Score</th>
<th>No change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Coahuila</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuevo León</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baja California</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tamaulipas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State of Mexico</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puebla</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tabasco</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baja California Sur</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico City</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hidalgo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nayarit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chihuahua</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Luis Potosi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Querétaro</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aguascalientes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guanajuato</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sonora</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veracruz</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guerrero</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zacatecas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sinaloa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oaxaca</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yucatán</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durango</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michoacán</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morelos</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quintana Roo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jalisco</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colima</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campeche</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chiapas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tlaxcala</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reduction of the Civic Space and the Decline of the Press as an Effective Check on State Governments

Changes in the scores of sub-factor 1.5 from the 2019-2020 to the 2020-2021 edition. Civil society and the media continue to be the most effective checks on state government power.

The most effective checks on government power are civil society and the media (sub-factor 1.5); however, 16 states saw a reduction in their scores.

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law. Scores are rounded to two decimal places.
Decline of Control of Corruption in Security and Law Enforcement Forces

Changes in the scores of sub-factor 2.3 Absence of corruption in the security and law enforcement systems, from the 2019-2020 to the 2020-2021 edition of the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index*, by state. There is a decline in the absence of corruption in the security and law enforcement systems. Since the previous edition of the Index, 20 states decreased, increased in 10, and remained the same in 2.

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law. Scores are rounded to two decimal places.
Challenges in Environmental Regulatory Enforcement

Scores of sub-factor 6.1, which measures whether government regulations such as labor, environmental, commercial, and public health are effectively enforced, in the *Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021*. Environmental regulatory enforcement (indicator 6.1.2) is the area with most challenges in all states. In contrast, public health and commercial regulatory enforcement had the highest scores.

Note: The Index uses a scale from 0 to 1, where 1 indicates the highest adherence to the rule of law. Scores are rounded to two decimal places.
Rule of Law and Public Health During Pandemics

We polled 347 public health specialists across Mexico between July and October 2020 and obtained insights about the ability of state health systems to react to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Most specialists think that the state public health services have succeeded in informing the population during the pandemic but have had trouble offering quality care to the entire population, providing sufficient and adequate material to health personnel to address the crisis, and generating reliable data in a timely manner.

How would you rate the capacity of the state health systems or the Health Ministry to...?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Good + Very Good</th>
<th>Bad + Very Bad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inform the general population about protocols to prevent infections</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offering quality services, without discrimination, to people of</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vulnerable groups</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offering quality services to all the population, regarding their</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>socioeconomic level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generate timely data</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Providing sufficient and adequate equipment to the health workers for</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the COVID-19 pandemic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The pressure of the COVID-19 pandemic on the public health system shows its structural weaknesses.

Source: Public Health Specialist Poll (WJP)
# Factors and sub-factors of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021

The *Mexico States Rule of Law Index* includes data organized in eight factors, which are disaggregated in 42 sub-factors, which reflect the perspectives and experiences of people in the 32 states.

## Constraints on Government Powers

- **1.1** Government powers are effectively limited by the local legislature
- **1.2** Government powers are effectively limited by the local judiciary
- **1.3** State government powers are effectively limited by independent auditing and review
- **1.4** State government officials are penalized when they abuse their powers or fail to comply with regulations
- **1.5** State government powers are subject to non-governmental checks from civil society, political parties, and the press
- **1.6** Elections are free, clean, and transparent

## Absence of Corruption

- **2.1** Government officials in the state executive branch do not commit acts of corruption
- **2.2** Government officials in the judicial branch do not use public office for private gain
- **2.3** Government officials in the safety and law enforcement systems do not use public office for private gain
- **2.4** Government officials in the legislative branch do not use public office for private gain

## Open Government

- **3.1** Civic participation in decision-making
- **3.2** The right to public information is effectively guaranteed

## Fundamental Rights

- **4.1** Equal treatment and absence of discrimination
- **4.2** The right to life and security of the person is effectively guaranteed
- **4.3** Due process of the law and rights of the accused are effectively guaranteed
- **4.4** Freedom of opinion and expression is effectively guaranteed
- **4.5** Freedom of belief and religion is effectively guaranteed
- **4.6** The right to privacy is effectively guaranteed
- **4.7** Freedom of assembly and association is effectively guaranteed
- **4.8** Fundamental labor rights are effectively guaranteed

## Order & Security

- **5.1** Absence of homicides
- **5.2** Absence of crime
- **5.3** Perception of safety

## Regulatory Enforcement

- **6.1** Government regulations are effectively enforced
- **6.2** Government regulations are applied and enforced without corruption
- **6.3** Administrative proceedings are conducted effectively and efficiently
- **6.4** Due process is respected in administrative proceedings
- **6.5** The state government does not expropriate without lawful process and adequate compensation

## Civil Justice

- **7.1** People know their rights and trust civil justice institutions
- **7.2** People have access to information and affordable quality legal counsel when facing legal problems or disputes
- **7.3** People can resolve their legal problems easily and without high costs or bureaucratic procedures
- **7.4** The civil justice system is impartial, independent, and free of corruption
- **7.5** The civil justice system guarantees a quality process
- **7.6** The civil justice system is not subject to unreasonable delay
- **7.7** Resolutions of civil and administrative courts are effectively enforced
- **7.8** Alternative dispute resolution mechanisms are accessible, impartial, and effective

## Criminal Justice

- **8.1** The police and the public ministry investigate crimes effectively
- **8.2** The criminal adjudication system is timely and effective
- **8.3** Victim’s rights are effectively guaranteed
- **8.4** Due process of the law for the accused is effectively guaranteed
- **8.5** Criminal justice system is impartial, independent, and free of corruption
- **8.6** The prison system guarantees the safety and rights of detained people
The Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021 uses a conceptual framework and methodology that are very similar to those used by WJP around the world, but has adapted the concepts and surveys to the Mexican context in order to provide a comprehensive summary of the rule of law situation in each of the states.

The WJP team conducted an exhaustive consultation with academia and experts to design five surveys: one General Population Poll (GPP) and four Qualified Respondent Questionnaires (QRQs).

I. GENERAL POPULATION POLL
25,600 face-to-face interviews
800 interviews in each state
Representative sample of the population of 18 years and above.

II. QUALIFIED RESPONDENT QUESTIONNAIRES
2,351 interviews with experts in:
- Civil Justice
- Criminal Justice
- Labor Justice
- Public Health

III. THIRD-PARTY SOURCES
12 indicators of administrative information and survey databases representative at the state level

WJP cleaned and processed the data:
- 607 variables were codified
- Average scores were calculated for every state
- Scores for the eight factors and 42 sub-factors were calculated
- Scores for the factors were aggregated to calculate the scores for the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021

Data were validated with:
- Over 20 quantitative and qualitative indicators from other organizations
- News media and qualitative reports.
- Review with a diverse group of experts from a variety of fields
About the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021

The Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021 is the third edition of the only subnational index produced by the WJP and is one of the most complete measurements of institutional performance in the country. The Index presents new data organized into eight factors that are disaggregated into 42 sub-factors. To present an accurate portrait of how the rule of law is experienced from a citizen perspective, each score is calculated using two original sources of data collected by the WJP in each state:

- A General Population Poll administered to a representative sample of 800 adults in each state, yielding a total of 25,600 surveyed individuals.
- A Qualified Respondents' Questionnaires (QRQs) aimed at attorneys specialized in: i) civil, administrative, and commercial law; ii) criminal law; iii) labor law; and to health personnel specialized in iv) public health.

The WJP also compiled administrative information and state representative surveys addressing rule of law issues to complement the WJP’s other sources of information.

For the complete methodology and more detailed information on each state, see the report of the Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2020-2021, available at www.worldjusticeproject.org and www.worldjusticeproject.mx.

Four Universal Principles of the Rule of Law

For the WJP, the rule of law is a principle of governance in which the following four principles apply:

1. Accountability

The government as well as private actors are accountable under the law.

2. Just Laws

The laws are clear, publicized, stable, and just; are applied evenly; and protect fundamental rights, including the security of persons and property and certain core human rights.

3. Open Government

The processes by which the laws are enacted, administered, and enforced are accessible, fair, and efficient.

4. Accessible & Impartial Dispute Resolution

Justice is delivered timely by competent, ethical, and independent representatives and neutrals who are accessible, have adequate resources, and reflect the makeup of the communities they serve.

About the World Justice Project

The World Justice Project® (WJP) is an independent, international, and multi-disciplinary organization working to advance the rule of law around the world. The rule of law is the foundation for communities of equity, opportunity, and peace - underpinning development, accountable government, and respect for fundamental rights. For more information, visit: www.worldjusticeproject.org and www.worldjusticeproject.mx.
Other Publications from the World Justice Project

For more information, visit: worldjusticeproject.org and worldjusticeproject.mx
Failed Justice: Prevalence of Torture in Mexico’s Criminal Justice System 2006-2016
(Available in English and Spanish)

Memoria estadística de la transición entre dos México: Logros y retos del Nuevo Sistema de Justicia Penal
(32 volumes, only available in Spanish)

Mexico States Rule of Law Index 2018: Perceptions and experiences in 32 states
(available in English and Spanish)

Mexico’s New Criminal Justice System: Substantial Progress and Persistent Challenges 2018
(Available in English and Spanish)

Realizing Justice For All World Justice Forum Report 2019

Global Insights on Access to Justice 2019